

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS  
AUSTIN DIVISION

UMG RECORDINGS, INC., *et al.*,

Plaintiffs,

vs.

GRANDE COMMUNICATIONS  
NETWORKS LLC,

Defendant.

§  
§  
§  
§  
§  
§  
§  
§  
§  
§  
§

Civil Action No. 1:17-cv-00365-DAE

**GRANDE’S PROPOSED INSTRUCTION REGARDING**  
**ELIGIBILITY FOR STATUTORY DAMAGES UNDER 17 U.S.C. § 412**

Pursuant to the Court's direction by email on October 30, 2022, Grande hereby offers its identification of evidence regarding eligibility under 17 U.S.C. § 412. Plaintiffs have the burden to show that each asserted work is eligible. *See, e.g., Didio v. Jones*, No. CV13-4949 PSG, 2017 WL 11636167, at \*1 (C.D. Cal. Apr. 17, 2017) ("Plaintiffs therefore carry the burden of demonstrating that they complied with § 412's requirements.").<sup>1</sup> To show publication and registration dates, Plaintiffs rely on registration certificates and corresponding "summaries." *See* PX20-24. To show earliest alleged infringement dates, Plaintiffs rely on PX-459. This evidence fails to demonstrate eligibility of each work. For example:

- For three Bruno Mars songs asserted by Warner, PX-459 (rows 78-80) shows a first infringement date of 2/14/2013, and PX-23 (at 1) shows a registration date of 2/19/2013.
- For Sony's asserted song "The Pretender," PX-459 (at row 36) shows first infringement on 5/8/2012, and PX-21 (at 1) shows registration on 4/4/2014.
- For Sony's asserted song "The Beginning...", PX-21 (at 5) shows a registration date of 10/1/2013, and PX-459 (at row 156) shows first infringement on 9/25/2013.
- For three Katy Perry songs asserted by UMG, Plaintiffs identify infringement dates that precede **publication** dates.<sup>2</sup>
- For several asserted works, Plaintiffs' exhibits identify multiple registration dates, and eligibility depends on which registration date the jury applies.<sup>3</sup>

The record also contains evidence sufficient for a juror to reject Plaintiffs' proffered first infringement dates, including evidence that Rightscorp notice dates do not reflect actual uploading or downloading (*see, e.g.,* PX-5); evidence of download dates that differ from first infringement dates (*see id.*); and testimony that Rightscorp ignored choke data (*See, e.g.,* 10/27/2022 Trial Tr. at 147).

---

<sup>1</sup> *See also, e.g., Ushodaya Enterprises, Ltd. v. V.R.S. Int'l, Inc.*, 64 F. Supp. 2d 352, 353 (S.D.N.Y. 1999) ("Plaintiff bears the burden of demonstrating that it complies with the prerequisite of section 412."); *Data Gen. Corp. v. Grumman Sys. Support Corp.*, 825 F. Supp. 361, 364 (D. Mass. 1993), *aff'd and remanded*, 36 F.3d 1147 (1st Cir. 1994) ("Thus, [plaintiff] carries the burden of demonstrating that it complied with § 412's prerequisite.").

<sup>2</sup> Compare PX-459 row 215 ("Dark Horse," first infringement 10/1/2013) and rows 293-294 ("By the Grace of God" and "Choose Your Battles," first infringement 10/20/2013) with PX-19 at p. 2 (publication date of 10/22/2013).

<sup>3</sup> *See, e.g.,* PX-19 at 12 (Mariah Carey); PX-459 at rows 588-591 (first infringement 5/5/2014).

Dated: October 31, 2022

By: /s/ Richard L. Brophy

Richard L. Brophy  
Zachary C. Howenstine  
Mark A. Thomas  
Margaret R. Szewczyk  
Sydney K. Johnson  
ARMSTRONG TEASDALE LLP  
7700 Forsyth Blvd., Suite 1800  
St. Louis, Missouri 63105  
Telephone: 314.621.5070  
Fax: 314.621.5065  
rbrophy@armstrongteasdale.com  
zhowenstine@armstrongteasdale.com  
mszewczyk@armstrongteasdale.com  
mathomas@armstrongteasdale.com  
skjohnson@armstrongteasdale.com

J. Stephen Ravel  
Texas State Bar No. 16584975  
Diana L. Nichols  
Texas State Bar No. 00784682  
KELLY HART & HALLMAN LLP  
303 Colorado, Suite 2000  
Austin, Texas 78701  
Telephone: 512.495.6429  
Fax: 512.495.6401  
Email: steve.ravel@kellyhart.com  
diana.nichols@kellyhart.com

*Attorneys for Defendant Grande  
Communications Networks, LLC*